Justice

Libertarianism

5. Libertarianism: Free Market Philosophy

Objections to J.S. Mill's Utilitarianism

- **re: Higher pleasure** — Experiment with people actually selecting The Simpsons over Shakespeare
- **re: Individual rights** — What if we can violate individual rights to make more people happy on long term run?
  - Intuition: reasons for respect rights goes beyond utility on the long run - we can't kill one checkup patient to save 5 just because of long run

Fundamental individual right is the right to liberty — by Robert Nozick

THE LIBERTARIAN VIEW OF GOVERNMENT
1. No Paternalist Legislation
2. No Morals Legislation
3. No Redistribution of Income from Rich to Poor

- **1. No Paternalist Legislation** — Wearing or not wearing sear belts is our business (people pay their medical bills) - so the state has no business here
- **2. No Morals Legislation** — E.g. sex between gays - nobody is harmed, nobody's rights are violated, so the state should get out of this business entirely
- **3. No Redistribution of Income from Rich to Poor** — No taxes!
  - Robert Nozick and others say that only minimal taxes are ok but just for what everybody needs: national defense, police force, judicial system to enforce contracts and property rights

NOZICK: WHAT MAKES INCOME DISTRIBUTION JUST?
1. Justice in Acquisition (initial holdings)
2. Justice in Transfer (free market)

- Justice in Acquisition (initial holdings)
- Justice in Transfer (free market)

Example: Bill Gates — 40B$ — 150$/second since he started Microsoft
- 👎 Utilitarianists would take his money to give them to poor (to maximize good)
- 👍 But Libertarians are against such "theft" - if he earned it FAIRLY it belongs to him!

NOZICK'S ARGUMENT AGAINST TAXATION
Taxation = taking of earnings
Taking of earnings = forced labor
Forced Labor = slavery
Violates Principle of Self-Possession

- 👍 Robert Nozick's arguments against Taxation
- This is why Utilitarianism is wrong!

6. Libertarianism: Do We Own Ourselves?

Objections to Libertarianism

- ❓👍 Paid (non-public) police and fire protection creates problem of "free riders"
  - Milton Friedman told that this could be avoided
    - ⚠️ Example: fire guarding subscription and person who failed to renew and got fire in his house and firemen were just watching
    - ❓ Q: This is bad example - free riders will remain if all around has police protection then I need it less!
- 1. The poor need the money more
- 2. Taxation by consent of the governed (majority) is not carried "under the force"
  - 👍 But what about rights of free speech and religion liberty? We have some rights that cannot be taken by government!
- 3. The successful owe a debt to society
- ❓👍 4. Wealth depends partly on LUCK so it isn't deserved
- ❓ Q: Monopolies

So - many people object to Libertarianism with "we own ourselves" and all consequences
- 👍 But Libertarians do the good thing - they combat Utilitarianism idea of using people for the collective happiness!
  - There is another approach by John Lock (in the next lecture)